

as Pastor of St. Bonaventure Parish, Manomet, effective July 10, 1986. I note that you are submitting your resignation for personal and medical reasons upon the advice of your physician." See Rynne, Paul 1-140. On June 3, 1986, Bishop Banks wrote to Reverend J. William Huber at the House of Affirmation and noted: "it seems that there are rumors that this incident is not isolated. My own guess is that the problem is deep rooted." See Rynne, Paul 1-144.

Father Rynne was sent for evaluations at the House of Affirmation and at Southdown. See Rynne, Paul 1-148; 1-153; 1-158. Following these evaluations, there were still lingering questions about whether Father Rynne still posed a threat to minors. See Rynne, Paul 1-166-1-68. An "evaluation of services" form completed by the RCAB indicated that it was "too soon to say" whether Father Rynne could responsibly engage in active ministry. See Rynne, Paul 1-166-1-68. Nonetheless, on July 13, 1987, Bernard Cardinal Law appointed Father Rynne to the position of Parochial Vicar at St. Margaret's Parish in Brockton, Massachusetts. See Rynne, Paul 1-169.

23. PAUL V. TIVNAN

Paul V. Tivnan was ordained a priest into the Archdiocese of Boston on February 1, 1963 at the age of twenty-seven. See Tivnan-2 015. From 1963 to 1968, Father Tivnan served as an Assistant in Saint Therese Parish in Everett, followed by an assignment at St. Paul Parish in Hamilton, from 1968 through

1970. See Tivnan-2 015. In September, 1970, he was assigned an assistant priest at Our Lady Comforter of the Afflicted in Waltham followed by a short assignment at Our Lady of Grace in Chelsea until June of 1972. See Tivnan-2 015.

Father Tivnan served at various parishes between 1968 and 1970. See Tivnan-2 015. In an RCAB Personnel Board Data Form dated 1968, Father Tivnan expressed his interest in participating in “youth work, high school chaplain and hospital chaplain.” See Tivnan-2 020-022. In the fall of 1970, Tivnan received a letter from Cardinal Cushing informing him that he was to be transferred from Saint Paul Parish in Hamilton to Our Lady Comforter in Waltham as an assistant priest and asked for “prayers during these difficult days.” See Tivnan-2 032.

Between the years of 1972 and 1985, Father Tivnan was assigned and transferred to four parishes, serving the communities of Chelsea, Sudbury, Needham and Marlboro until he was put on a “Sick Leave” in May of 1985 by Cardinal Law. See Tivnan-2 015, 2 063. A memorandum dated April 26, 1985, sent by Father Ryan to Bishop Banks and Bishop McCormack discussed a telephone call that Father Ryan had received from a Sudbury policeman regarding possible “‘concerns’ in regard to impropriety in morals, etc” by Father Tivnan. See Tivnan, P.-1 to 2. Father Ryan continued to state that after the telephone conversation with the policeman, he spoke with the victim referred to

as the “son of [REDACTED],” and discussed the allegations and possible action that could be taken. See Tivnan, P.-1-2.

A few weeks later on May 11, 1985, Bishop McCormack met with [REDACTED] [REDACTED], “the [REDACTED],” and his father as well as another young man, [REDACTED] [REDACTED] See Tivnan, P.-4. In handwritten notes taken by Bishop McCormack it states that while Father Tivnan was “stationed in Sudbury, Needham and Marlboro he used his office to gain sexual acts from these youth.” See Tivnan, P.-4. [REDACTED] explained to McCormack that he had been forced into various sex acts including being fondled, and had told Father Tivnan to stay away from him. See Tivnan, P.-4. [REDACTED] also described to McCormack that he had been involved in “sexual activity twice a week” with Father Tivnan and that he was scared to tell his parents about the abuse, but once his father had found out he immediately contacted the chancery as well as the Sudbury Police Department. See Tivnan, P.- 4. During this meeting the boys also shared with McCormack the fact that they had a list of twelve other boys that Father Tivnan saw regularly, including one who had committed suicide when Father Tivnan went to visit him. See Tivnan, P.- 4.

Within one week, Father Tivnan was flown by the RCAB to Washington, DC to seek an evaluation by Dr. Michael Peterson at St. Luke’s Institute, who determined that Father Tivnan suffered from Klinefelter’s Syndrome, which

could be treated by Depoprovera. See Tivnan-2 070, 2 065, 2 077, 2 081. In addition, while on his trip to Washington, DC, Father Tivnan attended a "Sexuality Awareness Workshop." See Tivnan-2 075-076. According to a memorandum sent by Father Ryan to Bishop McCormack, Father Tivnan had also been evaluated at the St. Luke Institute, the Clinical Radiologists facility in Silver Springs, as well as METPATH, Inc in Hackensack, New Jersey. See Tivnan-2 078.

After returning from his treatment, Father Tivnan spoke with Bishop McCormack and reviewed the evaluation completed by Dr. Peterson, determining that he desired to have a mastectomy due to his diagnosis in addition to the fact that he was very self conscious of the effects the unusual endocrine disorder had on his body. See Tivnan-2 081-082.

In September of 1985 a confidential memo was sent to Bishop Banks from Bishop McCormack inquiring about the RCAB's financial responsibility for [REDACTED], who has been in contact since the allegation was made. See Tivnan-2 098. The memorandum stated the following in regard to whether they should support [REDACTED]:

If we refuse it, then we are not pastorally helping him. If we accept it, are we acknowledging not only pastoral assistance, but opening ourselves up to some kind of legal intervention...My recommendation is that we offer him assistance since he has been involved in this matter for about 12 years.

See Tivnan-2 098. Bishop McCormack had a great deal of concern with putting Father Tivnan back within the ministry in February of 1986, and felt that there was a “question concerning legal and insurance liability.” See Tivnan-2 119. Also, in reviewing an evaluation completed by Dr. Cassem, Bishop McCormack stated the following:

My impression is that Paul will have a difficult time working in ministry. His resistance to insight and to appreciating the seriousness of his situation does not seem to offer much promise of personal development and change. The limited and isolated nature of the ministry in which he would be placed would be stressful for him...If Paul is placed in ministry, he will need to be ‘watched closely....’

See Tivnan-2 144-145. Bishop Alfred C. Hughes responds to Bishop McCormack and Bishop Banks by stating that “it should be made clear to him that the Archdiocese of Boston will not be able to continue him in pastoral ministry if there is one slip.” See Tivnan-2 151. In July of 1986, Father Tivnan returned to the Archdiocese of Boston with an assignment to reside at St. Michael’s Parish in Lowell and to assist at the Bon Secours Hospital in Methuen with extreme supervision by Reverend Gerry Wyrus, the Chairman of the Department of Pastoral Care. See Tivnan-2 171-172. Father Tivnan was also permitted to celebrate daily Mass in West Andover. See Tivnan-2 169. In July of 1986, an agreement was signed by Reverend Tivnan and Bishop McCormack stating the above. See Tivnan-2 171-172.

In August of 1986, Father Tivnan was removed from "Sick Leave" status and began his new assignment at Bon Secours Hospital until January of 1987. See Tivnan-2 179. At the time of the end of his assignment, William Lane, the President and CEO of Bon Secours Hospital requested for Bishop McCormack to revise the agreement to "allow Father Tivnan to function in the capacity requested." See Tivnan-2 208. Bishop McCormack agreed to allow Father Tivnan to be unrestricted in his work at the Hospital, with the exception of the Pediatric ward. See Tivnan-2 209.

In September of 1987, Father Tivnan was moved to St. Francis in Braintree to assist in nursing home care at Sacred Heart Parish in Weymouth. See Tivnan-2 015. He was allowed to celebrate Mass at the nursing home and "as needed in either of the above parishes (St. Francis or Sacred Heart)." See Tivnan-2 222. He was moved again in January of 1991 to Marion Manor in South Boston as an associate chaplain, where he lasted three short months due to the fact that there were complaints about him by his peers. See Tivnan-2 284, 2 320-321. After his removal from Marion Manor he was placed within the Carney and Deaconess Hospitals to assist in Chaplain work. See Tivnan-2 362.

In March of 1994 a complaint was made to Sr. Catherine Mulkerrin by, [REDACTED], a former altar boy at Saint Paul Parish in Hamilton, regarding an incident where Father Tivnan took John to visit his friends in Rockport and

fondled him while they slept in bed together. See Tivnan-2 370. John remembered thinking that “this is what old men do” while he pretended to be asleep during the abuse. See Tivnan-2 370.

In September of 1995, after requesting to be placed back in parish ministry, Father Tivnan was contacted by Father Flatley who expressed to him that his expectation to return is unrealistic and supports himself by forwarding him The Policy of the Archdiocese, “The assignment of one who has engaged in sexual misconduct with a minor will exclude parish ministry and other ministry that involves minors.” See Tivnan-2 401. Father Tivnan was thereafter placed at the Archdiocesan Priests’ Residence in Georgetown by Cardinal Law to live with other priests whose ministry was limited due to past allegations including Father Gale, Father Paquin and Father Mullin. See Tivnan-2 426, 430.

After much convincing by Father Murphy and Father McCarthy, Father Tivnan was placed on “Permanent Disability” status and moved from the Archdiocesan Residence to Beverly Common in 1998. See Tivnan-2 460, 2 463. A letter was sent to him from Cardinal Law stating the following:

Over the years many lives have been touched by your generous care and priestly concern. All of us in the Archdiocese are grateful to you for the work you have done while you were able. We shall always relay on your constant prayerful support.

See Tivnan-2 496. Even after Father Tivnan had been removed from the parish, he continued to have problems with young children. Tivnan 2-540. In May of

2001, Toni Terenzi, the Archdiocesan secretary, reported to Bishop Murphy that Father Tivnan had participated in a Mass at Saint Florence in Wakefield where five and six girls were in attendance. See Tivnan-2 540. Father Tivnan had apparently nudged one of the girls, who in turn reported the incident to Father Murphy. Father Higgins later contacted the girls father but a review of the RCAB documents produced shows that nothing materialized from the situation. See Tivnan-2 540; 547; 557.

24. ERNEST TOURIGNEY

Ernest Tourigney was ordained a priest of the Archdiocese of Boston in February 1961. His first assignment was Immaculate Conception in East Weymouth. See ET-0181. The RCAB was aware as early as May of 1974 that Father Tourigney was engaging in inappropriate sexual behavior with young boys. See ET-0004; 0098-99. Father Haley, pastor of St. Mary's in Holliston and the housekeeper spoke to Bishop Banks about a relationship between Father Tourigney and [REDACTED]. See ET-0004; 0098-99. After Father Tourigney and the boy denied the relationship, the matter was dropped, and he was returned to ministry. See ET-0004. Father Tourigney would go on to molest many other children.

In February 1974, a parishioner from St. Mary's in Holliston, Father Tourigney's second assignment, wrote to Cardinal Medeiros. See ET-0364.