## Court of Common Pleas of Philadelphia County Trial Division

For Prothonotary Use Only (Docket Number) MARCH 2011

Civil Cover Sheet		E-Filling Number: 1103010052	000034		
PLAINTIFF'S NAME JOHN DOE 166		DEFENDANTS NAME ARCHDIOCESE OF PHILAD	DEFENDANTS NAME ARCHDIOCESE OF PHILADELPHIA		
PLAINTIFF'S ADDRESS C/O MONAHAN LAW PRACTICE, PC 300 N POTTSTOWN PIKE, STE 210 EXTON PA 19341		DEFENDANTS ADDRESS 222 N 17TH STREET PHILADELPHIA PA 19103			
PLAINTIFF'S NAME		DEFENDANTS NAME ANTHONY BEVILACQUA			
PLAINTIFF'S ADDRESS		DEFENDANT'S ADDRESS 222 N 17TH STREET PHILADELPHIA PA 19103			
PLAINTIFF'S NAME		DEFENDANTS NAME JUSTIN RIGALI			
PLAINTIFF'S ADDRESS		DEFENDANTS ADDRESS 222 N 17TH STREET PHILADELPHIA PA 1910			
TOTAL NUMBER OF PLAINTIFFS TOT	AL NUMBER OF DEFENDANTS	COMMENCEMENT OF ACTION  Complaint Petition Action  Writ of Summons Transfer From	on		
	n-Jury 🔲 Petiti	ngs Action			
CASE TYPE AND CODE  20 — PERSONAL INJURY — OTHER  STATUTORY BASIS FOR CAUSE OF ACTION					
RELATED PENDING CASES (LIST BY CASE CA	APTION AND DOCKET NUMBER)	FILED PRO PROTHY	IS CASE SUBJECT TO COORDINATION ORDER? YES NO		
	N	MAR <b>07</b> 2011			
		S. GARRETT			
TO THE PROTHONOTARY: Kindly enter my appearance on b Papers may be served at the addr		Appellant: <u>JOHN DOE 166</u>			
NAME OF PLAINTIFF'S/PETITIONER'S/APPELLANT'S ATTORNEY DANIEL F. MONAHAN		ADDRESS 300 N. POTTSTOWN P	IKE		
PHONE NUMBER (610)363-3888	FAX NUMBER (610) 594-9556	EXTON PA 19341	STE. 210 EXTON PA 19341		
SUPREME COURT IDENTIFICATION NO. 28557		E-MAIL ADDRESS  DMonahan@JDLLM.com			
SIGNATURE OF FILING ATTORNEY OR PARTY  DANIEL MONAHAN		Monday, March 07,	Monday, March 07, 2011, 08:18 am		

#### COMPLETE LIST OF DEFENDANTS:

- 1. JOHN E. GILLESPIE 1436 LANSDOWNE AVENUE DARBY PA 19023-1218
- 2. MAGGIE MARSHALL
  222 N 17TH STREET
  PHILADELPHIA PA 19103
- 3. KAREN BECKER`
  222 N 17TH STREET
  PHILADELPHIA PA 19103
- 4. WILLIAM LYNN
  222 N 17TH STREET
  PHILADELPHIA PA 19103
- 5. JUSTIN RIGALI
  222 N 17TH STREET
  PHILADELPHIA PA 19103
- 6. ANTHONY BEVILACQUA
  222 N 17TH STREET
  PHILADELPHIA PA 19103
- 7. ARCHDIOCESE OF PHILADELPHIA 222 N 17TH STREET PHILADELPHIA PA 19103

### DANIEL F. MONAHAN ATTORNEY AT LAW

Attorney I.D. No. 28557 300 North Pottstown Pike, Suite 210 Exton, PA 19341 610-363-3888 dmonahan@JDLLM.com



#### MARCI A. HAMILTON ATTORNEY AT LAW

Attorney I.D. No. 54820 36 Timber Knoll Drive Washington Crossing, PA 18977 215-353-8984

hamilton02@aol.com

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Attorneys for Plaintiff

nammono2@doi.com minimysjor i van		
John Doe 166		COURT OF COMMON PLEAS
c/o Monahan Law Practice, P.C.	:	
300 North Pottstown Pike, Suite 210		PHILADELPHIA COUNTY,
Exton, PA 19341	:	PENNSYLVANIA
Plaintiff,	:	
v.	:	CIVIL ACTION
	:	
ARCHDIOCESE OF PHILADELPHIA	:	JURY TRIAL DEMANDED
222 N. 17 <sup>th</sup> Street	:	
Philadelphia, PA 19103	:	TERM, 2011
and	:	
CARDINAL ANTHONY BEVILACQUA	:	NO
222 N. 17 <sup>th</sup> Street	:	
Philadelphia, PA 19103	:	
and	:	
CARDINAL JUSTIN RIGALI	:	
222 N. 17 <sup>th</sup> Street	:	
Philadelphia, PA 19103	:	
and	:	
MSGR. WILLIAM LYNN	:	
222 N. 17 <sup>th</sup> Street	:	
Philadelphia, PA 19103	:	
and	:	
KAREN BECKER	:	
222 N. 17 <sup>th</sup> Street	:	

Case ID: 110300052

and

MAGGIE MARSHALL :

222 N. 17<sup>th</sup> Street : Philadelphia, PA 19103 :

and :

FR. JOHN E. GILLESPIE : 1436 Lansdowne Ave. : Darby, PA 19023-1218 : :

:

<u>Defendants.</u>:

#### NOTICE TO DEFEND

You have been sued in Court. If you wish to defend against the claims set forth in the following pages, you must take action within twenty (20) days after this Complaint and Notice are served, by entering a written appearance personally or by attorney and filing in writing with the Court your defenses or objections to the claims set forth against you. You are warned that if you fail to do so the case may proceed without you and judgment may be entered against you by the Court without further notice for any money claimed in the Complaint or for any other claim or relief requested by the Plaintiff. You may lose money or property or other rights important to you.

YOU SHOULD TAKE THIS PAPER TO YOUR LAWYER AT ONCE. IF YOU DO NOT HAVE A LAWYER, GO TO OR TELEPHONE THE OFFICE SET FORTH BELOW. THIS OFFICE CAN PROVIDE YOU WITH INFORMATION ABOUT HIRING A LAWYER.

IF YOU CANNOT AFFORD TO HIRE A LAWYER, THIS OFFICE MAY BE ABLE TO PROVIDE YOU WITH INFORMATION ABOUT AGENCIES THAT MAY OFFER LEGAL SERVICES TO ELIGIBLE PERSONS AT A REDUCED FEE OR NO FEE.

#### Philadelphia Bar Association

Lawyer Referral and Information Service One Reading Center Philadelphia, PA 19107 Telephone: 215-238-1701

- 2 -

#### DANIEL F. MONAHAN ATTORNEY AT LAW

Attorney I.D. No. 28557 300 North Pottstown Pike, Suite 210 Exton, PA 19341 610-363-3888 dmonahan@JDLLM.com

### MARCI HAMILTON ATTORNEY AT LAW

36 Timber Knoll Drive Washington Crossing, PA 18977 215-353-8984

hamilton02@aol.com

Attorneys for Plaintiff

John Doe 166		COURT OF COMMON PLEAS
c/o Monahan Law Practice, P.C.	•	
300 North Pottstown Pike, Suite 210		PHILADELPHIA COUNTY,
Exton, PA 19341		PENNSYLVANIA
Plaintiff,	:	
v.	:	CIVIL ACTION
	:	
ARCHDIOCESE OF PHILADELPHIA	:	JURY TRIAL DEMANDED
222 N. 17 <sup>th</sup> Street	:	
Philadelphia, PA 19103	:	TERM, 2011
and	:	
CARDINAL ANTHONY BEVILACQUA	:	NO
222 N. 17 <sup>th</sup> Street	:	
Philadelphia, PA 19103	:	
and	:	
CARDINAL JUSTIN RIGALI		
222 N. 17 <sup>th</sup> Street	:	
Philadelphia, PA 19103	:	
and	:	
MSGR. WILLIAM LYNN	:	
222 N. 17 <sup>th</sup> Street	:	
Philadelphia, PA 19103	:	
and	:	
KAREN BECKER	:	
222 N. 17 <sup>th</sup> Street	:	
Philadelphia, PA 19103	:	

and

MAGGIE MARSHALL :

222 N. 17<sup>th</sup> Street :

Philadelphia, PA 19103 :

and :

FR. JOHN E. GILLESPIE :

1436 Lansdowne Ave. :

Darby, PA 19023-1218

Defendants.:

#### PLAINTIFF'S COMPLAINT

And now Plaintiff, John Doe 166, by and through his undersigned counsel, brings this Complaint and sets forth as follows:

#### The Parties

- 1. Plaintiff, John Doe 166, is an adult male individual who is a citizen and resident of the State of Delaware. The identity of this Plaintiff is not pleaded in this Complaint in order to protect the identity of the Plaintiff because the Plaintiff was a victim of sex crimes when Plaintiff was a minor. The identity of the Plaintiff will be made known to the Defendants by separate communication.
- 2. Defendant Archdiocese of Philadelphia ("Archdiocese") was and continues to be a Roman Catholic organization and a non-profit religious corporation authorized to conduct business and conducting business in the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania with its principal place of business located at 222 N. 17<sup>th</sup> Street, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103. This Defendant is organized, exists and operates pursuant and by virtue of the laws of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania.
- 3. Msgr. William Lynn is an adult male individual resident and citizen of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania who was Secretary of Clergy for the Archdiocese under Cardinal Anthony Bevilacqua.

- 4. Cardinal Anthony Bevilacqua is an adult male individual resident and citizen of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania who was the Archbishop of the Archdiocese from 1987 through 2003.
- 5. Cardinal Justin Rigali is an adult male individual resident and citizen of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania who is the current Archbishop of the Archdiocese who was appointed Archbishop of the Archdiocese in 2003.
- 6. Karen Becker is an adult female individual resident and citizen of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania who is the Director of the Archdiocese's Office of Child and Youth Protection.
- 7. Maggie Marshall is an adult female individual resident and citizen of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania who is a Victim Assistance Coordinator for the Archdiocese of Philadelphia.
- 8. Fr. John E. Gillespie is an individual resident and citizen of Delaware County, Pennsylvania, and who was ordained as a Roman Catholic Priest in 1953 and remained a priest until his death in 2008.

#### **Facts**

- 9. On January 21, 2011, the Philadelphia District Attorney's Office issued a Grand Jury Report on abuse in the Philadelphia Archdiocese ("2011 Grand Jury Report").
- 10. The 2011 Grand Jury Report establishes that the Archdiocese has a long history of sexual abuse of children by Archdiocese priests that was known, tolerated, and hidden by high church officials, up to and including Cardinal Anthony Bevilacqua and Msgr. Lynn. The Grand Jury Report states:

"The rapist priests we accuse were well known to the Secretary of Clergy, but he cloaked their conduct and put them in place to do it again. The procedures implemented by the Archdiocese to help victims are in fact designed to help the abusers, and the Archdiocese itself. Worst of all, apparent abusers – dozens of them, we believe – remain on duty in the Archdiocese, today, with open access to new young prey."

2011 Grand Jury Report at 1.

- 11. The 2011 Grand Jury Report establishes that the Archdiocese, through its Victims Assistance Program and under Cardinal Rigali, tolerates and actively conceals the sexual abuse of children by Archdiocese priests for the benefit of the Archdiocese.
- 12. Victims of sexual abuse were misled by Cardinal Rigali into believing that the Archdiocese's only interest in having the victims make contact with the Archdiocese's Victims' Assistance Coordinator was to help the victims get the help that they need. The actual reason that Cardinal Rigali requested that the victims contact the Archdiocese Victims' Assistance Coordinator was to obtain information to begin to prepare a defense against any claim and to conceal the sexual abuse from law enforcement and the public. Examples of public statements that Cardinal Rigali made that misled victims into believing that the Archdiocese was solely concerned with helping them -- as opposed to building a defense file or re-victimizing them -- include:
  - a. "These changes have taken place over the past year as a part of our continuing efforts to be more responsive to the needs of victims. It is important to listen to the people who have been hurt and find out what they need. We listened and changed the way in which we respond" (News Release, Archdiocese of Philadelphia Revitalized Victim Assistance Program (Oct. 19, 2006),
  - b. "I urge anyone who was abused in the past to contact our Victim Assistance Coordinators who can help begin the healing process. ... We must never forget the victims who have been harmed so terribly and we will continue to listen to them. We remain dedicated to strengthening programs of prevention." (The Catholic Standard Times, Cardinal Justin

Rigali, National Sexual Assault Awareness, Child Abuse Month (April 29, 2010),)

- c. "Parents who may have concerns or fears in these areas and who wish to discuss them are encouraged to call the Archdiocesan Victim Assistance Program at 1-888-800-8780." (The Catholic Standard Times, Cardinal Justin Rigali, *Continued Efforts to Protect Our Young People* (April 16, 2009),)
- d. "The archdiocese is now making every effort to listen carefully in order to better understand and appreciate your experience. In meeting personally with many of you, I have learned of the recurring problem that affects your lives. This trauma can present itself as flashbacks, anger, anxiety, and depression. Some of you have spoken of loneliness and isolation. If you have similar experiences, we want to help you build a peaceful life. Reaching out for help, especially to the church, can be difficult. Our newly revitalized Victim Assistance Program is available to you. If you wish, feel free to call. God bless you." (Cardinal Justin Rigali, Recording: Cardinal Rigali's Audio Message about Victims' Assistance (Feb. 19, 2011, 11:15 AM)),
- e. "Even prior to the Bishops' Charter, the Archdiocese was committed to offering counseling assistance to those bringing forth allegations of sexual abuse as minors, whether or not the allegations were determined to be credible. Currently, our Archdiocesan Assistance Coordinators are providing professional counseling for 41 individuals. From 1994 through 2003, an average of \$125,000 has been paid annually by the Archdiocese for this counseling. ... The Archdiocese continues to reach out to those who are victims of sexual abuse as minors by priests." (Cardinal Justin Rigali, *Letter on the John Jay College Study* (Feb. 26, 2004))
- f. "One lesson that I have learned in that many victims are reluctant to turn to the Church for assistance. The Archdiocese of Philadelphia has diligently worked to restructure and refocus efforts of victim assistance. We have attempted to reach out to victims in many ways including my radio messages and advisements in newspapers. ... It is my hope that after you read this brochure, you will share it with a friend." (Cardinal Justin Rigali, Enhanced Efforts to Assist Victims of Clergy Sexual Abuse (Sept. 1, 2007)).

- 13. The victim assistance coordinators "mislead victims into believing that their discussions with the coordinators are protected by confidentiality." They are not. Victims' statements are shared throughout the Archdiocese and turned over to the Archdiocese's attorneys. 2011 Grand Jury Report at 7.
- 14. The victims also were led to believe that by reporting their abuse to the Victims Assistance Program, their perpetrators would be identified to the authorities:

"The Archdiocese stands ready to assist you in humble service. I am willing to meet with you as I have met with others. Our Victims Assistance Coordinators offer both spiritual and mental health services. Any victim or those who wish to report an allegation of abuse - which will be communicated immediately to civil authorities - may contact an assistance coordinator at 215-587-3880 or <a href="mailto:PhilaVAC@adphila.org">PhilaVAC@adphila.org</a>." (The Catholic Standard Times, Cardinal Justin Rigali, With Sorrow and Hope (Sept. 28, 2005)).

- 15. The victims are pressured to sign releases for records the Archdiocese's coordinators and attorneys otherwise would not be able to see. "Victims are led to believe that these releases will assist the coordinators in helping them. The church's position, it appears, is that coordinators must uncover every fact in order to make a determination about whether to refer the case to law enforcement. But that is not true. . . The only rational explanation for such procedures is not to guarantee the victim's recovery, but to guard the church against what its highest officials repeatedly refer to as 'scandal.'" 2011 Grand Jury Report at 7-8.
- 16. "[V]ictims are virtually hounded to give statements. . . . The only possible reason for this tactic would be to use the statements as ammunition to impeach victims, in an effort to make them appear incredible. . . . Such procedures are, to state it softly, one-sided and the side taken is not that of the victim." 2011 Grand Jury report at 9.
- 17. The 2011 Grand Jury Report concludes that victim assistance programs cannot be successfully operated in the interest of victims "by the church itself." And that the Church is

entitled to defend itself in the courts, "but it can no longer try to play both sides of the fence with its victims." 2011 Grand Jury report at 11.

- 18. In approximately 1994, Plaintiff attended Our Lady of Calvary parish in Philadelphia, Pennsylvania.
- 19. While attending Our Lady of Calvary, the minor Plaintiff was assigned as a sacristan, who was responsible for preparing the church sanctuary for mass and then cleaning up after mass.
- 20. From approximately 1994 through 1997, Msgr. Gillespie sexually abused the Plaintiff while Plaintiff was functioning as a sacristan at Our Lady of Calvary parish.
- 21. Msgr. Lynn and the Archdiocese were aware or should have been aware that Msgr. Gillespie had sexually abused children prior to Gillespie sexually abusing the Plaintiff.
- 22. In 1994, Msgr. Gillespie personally informed Msgr. Lynn that he had sexually abused two parish boys in the past.
- 23. Upon information and belief, in 1994, Msgr. Lynn communicated Msgr. Gillespie's admission about the two parish boys to Cardinal Bevilacqua.
- 24. Despite Msgr. Gillespie's admission that he had been sexually inappropriate with two boys, Msgr. Lynn did not initiate or conduct an investigation. Nor did Cardinal Bevilacqua. In fact, Msgr. Gillespie remained functioning as a priest at Our Lady of Calvary parish where he ultimately sexually abused the Plaintiff. Msgr. Lynn did not report anything relating to this 1994 report or Msgr. Gillespie's admission, to law enforcement.
- 25. In 1997, Msgr. Lynn received another complaint about Msgr. Gillespie being sexually inappropriate with a 12-year-old boy during confession. Despite this 1997 report, Msgr. Lynn conducted no investigation and Msgr. Gillespie continued to function as a priest at Our

Lady of Calvary parish. Msgr. Lynn did not report anything relating to the 1997 report of sexual misconduct to law enforcement.

- 26. In 2000, Msgr. Lynn received another report that Msgr. Gillespie had sexually abused a high school-aged boy. In response to this report, Msgr. Gillespie confessed to having touched the boy as well as several other boys. The boy, who made the report, was told that Msgr. Gillespie would be taken care of and that Msgr. Gillespie would never be around children again.
- 27. In response to the 2000 report of sexual abuse, the Archdiocese, led by Cardinal Bevilacqua, determined that Msgr. Gillespie was a risk to be performing parish work, because of the danger that Msgr. Gillespie posed relating to these numerous incidents of sexual misconduct.
- 28. In 2000, Msgr. Lynn was allowed to tender Msgr. Gillespie's his resignation; however, Msgr. Gillespie was allowed to continue as the Pastor of Our Lady of Victory for three months afterward. In addition, Msgr. Gillespie was allowed to continue in active ministry, including hearing confessions of school children after 2000.
- 29. The Archdiocese has a long history of concealing the sexual abuse of children by its clergy.
- 30. Monsignor William Lynn was the Secretary of Clergy under Cardinal Anthony Bevilacqua.
- 31. Upon information and belief, Msgr. Lynn acted as the personnel director for priests.
- 32. It was Msgr. Lynn's job to review all reports of abuse, to recommend action, and to monitor the abuser's future conduct.

- 33. Msgr. William Lynn assisted priests who he knew to have sexually abused children to obtain new assignments within the Archdiocese in order to conceal their criminal activity and protect the Archdiocese's reputation. 2011 Grand Jury Report at 43-53.
- 34. Msgr. Lynn's purposeful failure to remove pedophile priests caused Msgr. Lynn to be charged with endangering the welfare of a child, a felony of the third degree by the Philadelphia County District Attorney.
- 35. Msgr. Lynn did more than passively allow the molesters to remain in positions where they could continue to prey on children. When victims complained or scandal threatened, Msgr. Lynn recommended that the abusers be transferred to new parishes, where the unsuspecting faithful would not know to be wary and vigilant, and where the abusive clergymen could go on exploiting their positions of trust and authority to pursue criminal activity.
  - 36. Cardinal Bevilacqua controlled the Archdiocese's handling of child sex abuse.
- 37. While the Archbishop of the Archdiocese, Cardinal Bevilacqua was insistent, in all cases involving the sexual abuse of minors by priests, that parishioners be lied to about the Archdiocese's knowledge about the abuse by the priest. Msgr. Lynn followed this policy.
- 38. The Archdiocese publicly promotes its victim assistance programs as solely intended for victims of sexual abuse to get help, when in fact, the victim assistance programs are used by the Archdiocese to gather information to give to its attorneys in order to discredit the victims, defend the Archdiocese against any claims and conceal the crimes of Archdiocese employees. According to the 2011 Grand Jury Report, the Archdiocese "victim assistance coordinators" misled victims into believing that the victim's discussions with the coordinators are protected by confidentiality, when in fact that is not the case. In fact, the victim assistance coordinators did not keep the victim's statements confidential and instead turned the statements over to the attorneys for the Archdiocese and others in the Archdiocese.

- 39. The victims assistance program is advertised as though it operates on the principle of serving the best interests of the clergy sex abuse victim. Instead, it operates to protect the Archdiocese's interests first.
- 40. In 2010, the Plaintiff met with the Archdiocese Victims Assistance Coordinator, Maggie Marshall over the telephone. Upon information and belief, the Archdiocese used the Victims Assistance process to gather information which it in turn gave to its attorneys in order to use said information against the Plaintiff.
- 41. Victim assistance coordinators also forced victims to sign releases for records in the possession of third parties, such as outside therapists and the military. The victims are led to believe that these releases will assist the coordinators in helping the victim. Instead, the records secured through the releases are turned over to Archdiocese attorneys and used to defend the Archdiocese against any claims by the victim. Specifically, the records were used by Archdiocese attorneys to build the defense that the statute of limitations had expired on the victim's claim.
- 42. The victim assistance coordinators and others employed by the Archdiocese regularly encouraged victims to not report the incidents of sexual abuse to law enforcement.
- 43. According to the January 2011 Grand Jury Report, the Archdiocese maintains "secret archive files" which contain reports of priest sexual abuse of minors. These "secret archive files" contain evidence of criminal conduct of Archdiocese clergy that was and continues to be withheld from law enforcement. 2011 Grand Jury Report at 22, 43;
- 44. The sexual abuse and exploitation of Plaintiff and the circumstances under which it occurred caused Plaintiff to develop various psychological coping mechanisms, including not recognizing the extent of the injuries he experienced as a result of the sexual abuse described herein.

45. As a direct result of the wrongful conduct alleged herein, Plaintiff has suffered, and continues to suffer great pain of mind and body, shock, emotional distress, physical manifestations of emotional distress, embarrassment, loss of self-esteem, disgrace, humiliation, and loss of enjoyment of life; has suffered and continues to suffer spiritually; was prevented and will continue to be prevented from performing Plaintiffs' daily activities and obtaining the full enjoyment of life; has sustained and continues to sustain loss of earnings and earning capacity; and/or has incurred and continues to incur expenses for medical and psychological treatment, therapy, and counseling.

# COUNT I - CIVIL CONSPIRACY TO ENDANGER CHILDREN Plaintiff John Doe 166 v. Archdiocese of Philadelphia, Cardinal Anthony Bevilacqua, Cardinal Justin Rigali, Msgr. William Lynn, Karen Becker, Maggie Marshall and Msgr. Gillespie

- 46. Plaintiff incorporates by reference all of the preceding paragraphs of this Complaint as if each and every one were individually set forth within this Count.
- 47. Defendants Archdiocese, Cardinal Anthony Bevilacqua, Cardinal Justin Rigali, Msgr. William Lynn, Karen Becker, Maggie Marshall, and Msgr. Gillespie, acting with a common purpose conspired to endanger the welfare of children in violation of Pennsylvania law.
- 48. The overt acts committed in pursuance of the common purpose to endanger the welfare of children include, but are not limited to:
  - a. The Defendants Archdiocese, Cardinal Anthony Bevilacqua, Cardinal Justin Rigali, Msgr. William Lynn, Karen Becker, Maggie Marshall, and Msgr. Gillespie maliciously concealed known incidents of childhood sexual abuse within the Archdiocese, including sexual abuse by Msgr. Gillespie.
  - b. Defendants Archdiocese, Cardinal Anthony Bevilacqua, Cardinal Justin

Rigali, Msgr. William Lynn, Karen Becker, Maggie Marshall implemented programs and procedures that were misrepresented to the public as providing help to victims of childhoods sexual abuse by clergy, but were instead maliciously used to develop information to protect the Archdiocese from liability for its misconduct in handling predatory priests and used to further conceal the identity and illegal activities of predatory priests from law enforcement, parishioners and the public.

- c. When a report that an Archdiocese priest had sexually abused a child was made to the Archdiocese, Defendants Archdiocese, Cardinal Anthony Bevilacqua, Cardinal Justin Rigali, Msgr. William Lynn, Karen Becker, maliciously transferred the clergymen to new parishes, where the unsuspecting parishioners did not suspect that the priest was an abuser. As a result, on a significant number of occasions, the priest sexually abused children at the new parish.
- d. When a report that an Archdiocese priest had sexually abused a child was made to the Archdiocese, Defendants Archdiocese, Cardinal Anthony Bevilacqua, Cardinal Justin Rigali, Msgr. William Lynn, Karen Becker, maliciously concealed that information from parishioners, including Plaintiff. As a result, on a significant number of occasions, the priest sexually abused children at the new parish.
- e. Instead of protecting Archdiocese children, including the Plaintiff, from sexual abuse by known predator priests and other agents and employees, Archdiocese, Defendants Archdiocese, Cardinal Anthony Bevilacqua, Cardinal Justin Rigali, Msgr. William Lynn, and Karen Becker instead

shielded abusive clergy from criminal detection, shielded the Archdiocese hierarchy from scandal, and shielded the Archdiocese from financial liability.

- f. Victim assistance coordinators also forced victims to sign releases for records in the possession of third parties, such as outside therapists and the military. The victims are led to believe that these releases would assist the coordinators in helping the victim. Instead, the records secured through the releases are turned over to Archdiocese attorneys and used to defend the Archdiocese against any claims by the victim.
- g. The victim assistance coordinators employed by the Archdiocese regularly discouraged victims from reporting the sexual abuse by a priest to law enforcement.
- h. Archdiocese, Defendants Archdiocese, Cardinal Anthony Bevilacqua,
  Cardinal Justin Rigali, Msgr. William Lynn, Karen Becker maintained
  "secret archive files" containing reports of priest sexual abuse of minors
  which was withheld from law enforcement.
- i. Archdiocese, Defendants Archdiocese, Cardinal Anthony Bevilacqua, Cardinal Justin Rigali, Msgr. William Lynn, Karen Becker, in cases involving the sexual abuse of minors by priests, maliciously lied to parishioners about the Archdiocese's knowledge about the abuse by the priest.
- j. Archdiocese, Defendants Archdiocese, Cardinal Anthony Bevilacqua, Cardinal Justin Rigali, Msgr. William Lynn, Karen Becker maliciously ensured that the internal Archdiocese Review Board, that is responsible

for determining whether sexual abuse reports against a clergy member are credible, regularly found allegations of sexual abuse of minors by priests as being "unsubstantiated" even when there was very convincing evidence that the accusations were true.

- k. Upon information and belief, the Archdiocese, Defendants Archdiocese,
  Cardinal Anthony Bevilacqua, Cardinal Justin Rigali, Msgr. William
  Lynn, and Karen Becker destroyed documents that were evidence of
  criminal sexual conduct of children.
- 49. Said acts were committed with malice and with the intention that the welfare of children within the Archdiocese be endangered.
- 50. Plaintiff did not discover, nor could he have discovered through the use of reasonable diligence, the conspiracy described herein until 2011.
- 51. As a result of the above-described conduct, Plaintiff has suffered, and continues to suffer great pain of mind and body, shock, emotional distress, physical manifestations of emotional distress, embarrassment, loss of self-esteem, disgrace, humiliation, and loss of enjoyment of life; has suffered and continues to suffer spiritually; was prevented and will continue to be prevented from performing Plaintiff's daily activities and obtaining the full enjoyment of life; has sustained and will continue to sustain loss of earnings and earning capacity; and/or has incurred and will continue to incur expenses for medical and psychological treatment, therapy, and counseling.

WHEREFORE, Plaintiff, demands judgment for compensatory and punitive damages against Defendants, Archdiocese of Philadelphia, Cardinal Anthony Bevilacqua, Cardinal Justin Rigali, Msgr. William Lynn, Karen Becker, Maggie Marshall and Msgr. Gillespie, jointly and severally, in an amount in excess of Fifty Thousand Dollars (\$50,000.00), together with interest,

costs, and any other appropriate relief.

COUNT II - FRAUDULENT CONCEALMENT

Plaintiff John Doe 166 v. Archdiocese of Philadelphia, Cardinal Anthony Bevilacqua,

Cardinal Justin Rigali, Msgr. William Lynn, Karen Becker, Maggie Marshall, and Msgr.

Gillespie

52. Plaintiff incorporates by reference all of the preceding paragraphs of this

Complaint as if each and every one were individually set forth within this Count.

53. Defendants Archdiocese, Cardinal Anthony Bevilacqua, Cardinal Justin Rigali,

Msgr. William Lynn, Karen Becker, Maggie Marshall, and Msgr. Gillespie, engaged in a policy

of secrecy to protect the Archdiocese and lured Plaintiff into divulging private information for

the Archdiocese's legal and other benefit, without informing Plaintiff that his private information

could and would be used to aid them in fighting him and other victims in court, and therefore

committed fraud in violation of Pennsylvania law.

54. "The procedures implemented by the Archdiocese to help victims are in fact

designed to help the abusers, and the Archdiocese itself."

55. Plaintiff met with an Archdiocese's victims assistance counselor in order to obtain

assistance with the serious psychological, social, and physical problems that he has experienced

following his abuse by Msgr. Gillespie.

56. On information and belief, the victims assistance coordinator represented that

she/he was there to assist Plaintiff and required that the Plaintiff's communications to him/her

must be confidential.

57. On information and belief, the victims assistance counselor did not keep the

information confidential and instead reported Plaintiff's "confidential" communications to the

Archdiocese's attorneys as well as others in the Archdiocese.

58. On information and belief, the victims assistance counselor acted on behalf of the

- 17 -

Case ID: 110300052

Archdiocese, including Cardinal Bevilacqua, Cardinal Rigali, and Monsignor Lynn, among others, for the purpose of obtaining information that would aid the Archdiocese in defending any lawsuit brought by Plaintiff or any other victim, in avoiding public disclosure of its cover up of child sex abuse, and in aid of avoidance of criminal charges.

- 59. Accordingly, Plaintiff was injured by the Archdiocese's concealment of its actual purpose in having him disclose information regarding the sexual abuse of Plaintiff by Msgr. Gillespie.
- 60. Plaintiff did not discover, nor could he have discovered through the use of reasonable diligence, the fraudulent misrepresentation described herein until approximately February 2011.
- 61. As a result of the above-described conduct, Plaintiff has suffered, and continues to suffer great pain of mind and body, shock, emotional distress, physical manifestations of emotional distress, embarrassment, loss of self-esteem, disgrace, humiliation, and loss of enjoyment of life; has suffered and continues to suffer spiritually; was prevented and will continue to be prevented from performing Plaintiff's daily activities and obtaining the full enjoyment of life; has sustained and will continue to sustain loss of earnings and earning capacity; and/or has incurred and will continue to incur expenses for medical and psychological treatment, therapy, and counseling.

WHEREFORE, Plaintiff, demands judgment for compensatory and punitive damages against Defendants, Archdiocese of Philadelphia, Cardinal Anthony Bevilacqua, Cardinal Justin Rigali, Msgr. William Lynn, Karen Becker, Maggie Marshall and Msgr. Gillespie, jointly and severally, in an amount in excess of Fifty Thousand Dollars (\$50,000.00), together with interest, costs, and any other appropriate relief.

#### **COUNT III – ACTUAL FRAUD**

<u>Plaintiff, John Doe 166 v. Archdiocese of Philadelphia, Cardinal Anthony Bevilacqua, Cardinal Justin Rigali, Msgr. William Lynn, Karen Becker, Maggie Marshall, and Msgr. Gillespie</u>

- 62. Plaintiff incorporates by reference all of the preceding paragraphs of this Complaint as if each and every one were individually set forth within this Count.
- 63. Defendants were in a confidential relationship with the minor Plaintiff in that the Plaintiff was a minor parishioner of Our Lady of Victory parish and when Defendants took custody of the minor Plaintiff, Plaintiff trusted and relied upon the Defendants to protect him from any known danger.
- 64. Defendants affirmatively represented to Plaintiff and his family that Msgr. Gillespie did not have a history of molesting children, that Defendants did not know that Msgr. Gillespie had a history of molesting children and that Defendants did not know that Msgr. Gillespie was a danger to children.
- 65. Msgr. Gillespie did have a history of sexually molesting children. In fact, in 1994, prior to the sexual abuse of the Plaintiff described herein, Msgr. Gillespie had admitted to Msgr. Lynn that Msgr. Gillespie had sexually abused 2 boys from a previous parish.
- 66. Defendants knew that Msgr. Gillespie had a history of sexually molesting children and that he was a danger to children and that their representations described above were false.
- 67. Defendants intended that Plaintiff and his family rely on the false representations regarding Msgr. Gillespie so that the Defendants would not be subject to scandal and so that Defendants could protect the financial assets and reputation of the Archdiocese.
- 68. Plaintiff justifiably relied upon Defendants' misrepresentations which proximately caused Plaintiff to be sexually molested by Msgr. Gillespie and suffer the other damages described herein.

- 19 -

Case ID: 110300052

69. Plaintiff did not discover, nor could he have discovered through the use of

reasonable diligence, the fraud described herein until 2011.

As a result of the above-described conduct, Plaintiff has suffered, and continues to

suffer great pain of mind and body, shock, emotional distress, physical manifestations of

emotional distress, embarrassment, loss of self-esteem, disgrace, humiliation, and loss of

enjoyment of life; has suffered and continues to suffer spiritually; was prevented and will

continue to be prevented from performing Plaintiff's daily activities and obtaining the full

enjoyment of life; has sustained and will continue to sustain loss of earnings and earning

capacity; and/or has incurred and will continue to incur expenses for medical and psychological

treatment, therapy, and counseling.

70.

WHEREFORE, Plaintiff, demands judgment for compensatory and punitive damages

against Defendants, Archdiocese of Philadelphia, Cardinal Anthony Bevilacqua, Cardinal Justin

Rigali, Msgr, William Lynn, Karen Becker, Maggie Marshall and Msgr, Gillespie, jointly and

severally, in an amount in excess of Fifty Thousand Dollars (\$50,000.00), together with interest,

costs, and any other appropriate relief.

Dated: March 7, 2011

ĎANIEL F. MONAHAN, ESOUIRE

300 N. Pottstown Pike, Ste. 210

Exton, PA 19341

610-363-3888

dmonahan@JDLLM.com

MARCI A. HAMILTON, ESQUIRE

36 Timber Knoll Drive

Washington Crossing, PA 18977

215-353-8984

hamilton02@aol.com

Attorneys for Plaintiff John Doe 166

#### **VERIFICATION**

I, Daniel F. Monahan, Esquire, verify that I am the attorney for the Plaintiff and that the facts set forth in the foregoing Plaintiff's Complaint are true and correct to the best of my knowledge, information and belief. I understand that false statements made herein are subject to the penalties of 18 Pa.C.S.A. § 4904 relating to unsworn falsification to authorities.

Daniel F. Monahan, Esquire

Dated: March 7, 2011